



# ESPERANCA

Human Resource Development for Health

**Final Evaluation**

December 1997

Project No. 938-0158

Cooperative Agreement

No. PDC-0158-A-00-1101-00

Prepared for the  
Office of Private and Voluntary Cooperation  
Bureau for Humanitarian Response  
U.S. Agency for International Development

This report was prepared by AMA Technologies, Inc. under contract number FAO-C-00-95-00036-00 with the Office of Private and Voluntary Cooperation, Bureau for Humanitarian Response, USAID.

Team Leader: James J. Villalobos

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

|      |                                       |    |
|------|---------------------------------------|----|
| I.   | Introduction .....                    | 6  |
| II.  | Background .....                      | 6  |
| III. | Purpose of the Final Evaluation ..... | 7  |
| IV.  | Methology .....                       | 7  |
| V.   | Findings .....                        | 8  |
|      | A. Brazil Program .....               | 9  |
|      | B. Bolivia Program .....              | 11 |
|      | C. Mozambique Program .....           | 14 |
|      | D. Guinea-Bissau .....                | 16 |
| VI.  | Overall Conclusions .....             | 16 |
| VII. | Recommendations.....                  | 16 |

## APPENDICES:

- A. List of Personnel Contacted and Interviews Conducted
- B. List of Materials Reviewed and/or Studied
- C. List of Acronyms used in the Report
- D. Scope of Work for the Final Evaluation

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

A Final Evaluation of USAID Cooperative Agreement No. PDC-0158-A-00-1101-00, was conducted by a tri-lingual Consultant during the period of April 14 through June 30, 1997. On-site assessments were made in Brazil and Bolivia, South America, and in Mozambique (which, while in Mozambique, also included a review of data from Guinea-Bissau), Africa.

The Fundação Esperança has been carrying out a health education program since 1988, when USAID approved a First Matching Grant, and which ran from 1988 to 1991, to finance health training activities in Bolivia and Guinea-Bissau. A Second Matching Grant, which is the subject of this evaluation, was approved to begin on October 1, 1991 and run through September 30, 1996, to continue health training activities in Brazil and Bolivia.

The amount of the grant totaled \$1,000,000. Its purpose was to provide the financial support to capacitate public and private health institutions in Brazil and Bolivia in South America and Mozambique and Guinea-Bissau in Africa, to more effectively manage and administer their public health and primary health care delivery programs; an adjunct objective was the creation of self-replicating (multiplier) public health administration training modules and workshops.

The two institutions responsible for planning, carrying out, and evaluating the objectives of the Matching Agreement are the Fundação Esperança, a Non-Governmental Organization (NGO), located in Santarem, Brazil and the Universidad Núr in Santa Cruz, Bolivia. These institutions are highly commended for their professionalism, their unselfish dedication to human resource development, and their demonstrated sensitivity to the development needs of their respective citizenries.

The on-site evaluation further revealed that each institution has developed a cadre of well-trained subject-matter specialists and professionals who have become well-qualified instructors and trainers of trainers. Most importantly, they possess the required temperament and sensitivity to respond to peoples' needs within the national development process. Both institutions are highly respected, and enjoy a high degree of national and international professional reputation. Foreign universities and international organizations are frequently inviting representatives from both institutions to participate in symposia or to deliver presentations in the area of human resources training and community participation in development.

For example, the Fundação Esperança, was cited in the Report of the 2nd Conference of the London-based Non-Governmental Organization (NGO), "Action in International Medicine (AIM)", as an Institution which occupies a Leadership position in its organization (AIM); that the work it carries out, through the delivery of technical assistance and training in the area of health, merits the highest recognition; and that these efforts are in addition to the work involved in implementing the Intersectoral Project and collaboration with Regional Municipalities, particularly the involvement of communities in identifying development needs.

Professors from Núr University are also frequently invited by U.S. and European Universities, to give lectures on such subjects as Moral Leadership, Community Participation in Development, Training of Adults, Learning and Development Concepts, etc.

In the area of the Matching Grant, both Núr University, in Bolivia, and Fundação Esperança, in Brazil, demonstrated a high degree of responsibility toward assuring that the requirements specified under the Detailed Implementation Plans (DIPs) for each country were satisfied. Both organizations conducted institutional and training needs assessments, i.e., NGOs, PVOs, Governmental Entities, etc., and planned, developed, and administered the seminars, workshops, and training modules accordingly. As a result, although to varying degrees, each met or surpassed the numbers of workshops, participants, and institutions assisted. The multiplier training affect was evident throughout the visits to the various organizations. Trained trainers were training trainers to train others to train, etc.

Although the technical and professional requirements of the Grant were well attended to, the required clerical and administrative functions lacked the normal clerical or administrative documentation or degree of attention. Although this Consultant expected to have the statistical data ready for study and analysis, the data were either lacking or insufficient to arrive at well informed results. The data required quite a bit of back-tracking, particularly in the Bolivia training activities; these data were forwarded to the Consultant during the end of October, 1997. Had a closer and more precise documentation been made of the steps taken in the planning, implementation, and evaluation processes to accomplish the objectives of the Grant, particularly those identified by the Detailed Implementation Plan (DIP), this final evaluation would have been completed within the period of time anticipated. However, this did not, in any way, detract from the excellent delivery of training activities which the institutions have accomplished.

Concerning further financial support, conversations with representatives of the governments of Brazil, Bolivia, and Mozambique revealed that they are ready to complement foreign

financial assistance within their own community development plans. Because of their well-deserved reputation as professional training institutions, the Fundacao and the University have earned the respect and admiration of government officials with whom they have maintained close working relationships. In fact, they consider it rather important to identify funding in their economic and social development plans to support the strengthening of non-governmental organizations and municipalities; and that it is of utmost importance to include funding to finance training and other services needed, as identified by the peoples, in those municipalities that are located within the national economic and social development plans. Therefore, a positive climate exists for pursuing a three-way funding of training, i.e., government (national, state or local), student tuition, and foreign (in that order).

As to the "South-South" process of adapting the training material from one country (Portuguese) to another (Spanish), this Consultant observed that considerable time, effort, and money are used to translate materials and adapt or transfer them to another language and culture. A comparison of the training programs in Brazil, with those being administered in Mozambique and Guinea Bissau, establishes more commonality between Brazil and the Portuguese-speaking African countries, than with Bolivia, which, although Spanish, has its own "native" culture. A common cultural bond exists between Bolivia and its Spanish-speaking neighbors. It appears therefore, that Esperança, in Santarem, Brazil, should concentrate on furthering its programs in the Portuguese-speaking countries of Africa, and Núr University, in Santa Cruz, Bolivia, continue to devote its time in Bolivia and expand its services to the Spanish-speaking countries of Central and South America.

It is noteworthy to mention that the results of this evaluation evidenced a most encouraging aspect to a country's social and economic development. People from the communities are being included in training for development; and local democratic institutions are being used to further the overall development process. These institutions are sensitive to and are recognizing the differing needs, desires, and capacities of the communities. They are also supporting the civic education and training in skills required for effective participation in governmental and political processes essential for sustained self-government. Governments are beginning to "feel" and "see" the benefits which this approach contributes to overall country development.

## I. Introduction

Esperança, Inc., headquartered in Phoenix, Arizona, was awarded a five-year USAID Matching Grant II application for health human resource development in Latin America and Africa. The duration of the project was from September 30, 1991 through September 30, 1996. It followed and built upon the earlier Matching Grant I, also funded by USAID, whose duration was from August, 1988 to September, 1991.

The purpose of the grant was to provide matching funds to capacitate public and private health institutions in Brazil and Bolivia in South America, and Mozambique and Guinea-Bissau in Africa, to more effectively manage and administer their public health and primary health care delivery programs. Its main focus was the creation of self-replicating public health administration training modules and workshops; these, in turn, would provide the foundation upon which health management and administrative skills of individuals and institutions in both the public and the private sector, working in health programs in Latin America and Africa, would be improved and institutionalized.

An adjunct objective was to implement the concept of a "South-South" transfer of technology and networking process between Esperança's programs in Brazil and Bolivia, the rest of Spanish-speaking Latin America, and Portuguese-speaking African countries, particularly Mozambique and Guinea-Bissau.

## II. Background

Esperança, Inc. has been carrying out a health education program in the following countries:

- A. In Bolivia, S.A., in collaboration with Núr University;
- B. In Brazil, S.A., in collaboration with Fundação Esperança;
- C. In Mozambique and Guinea-Bissau, Africa, in collaboration with the Health Ministries of those countries.

The training programs has had several dimensions:

- 1. Formal, even a degree-granting level of education.
  - (a) A Masters in Public Health is granted in Bolivia upon completion of the course work; and,
  - (b) A graduate degree is also granted in Brazil.
- 2. Aside from these more formal programs, intensive weekend workshops were given for NGOs in Bolivia, and vocational training in Brazil.

### III. Purpose of the Final Evaluation

Expenditure of U.S. Funds requires a critical review to assure that their use was for the purpose or purposes for which intended, agreed upon, and appropriated. Therefore, this evaluation is required under Cooperative Agreement No. PDC-0158-A-00-11-1-00, dated September 30, 1991, and subsequent Amendments 1 through 4, the cumulative amount of the Matching Grant II which totaled \$1,000,000, and signed between Esperança, Inc. and the USAID.

This evaluation can serve as a reference or guiding instrument to the USAID as it studies and programs its future technical and financial assistance to developing countries.

Also, the evaluation can be useful to Esperança, Inc., the Fundação Esperança, and Núr University, as they proceed to strengthen and expand their training programs and seek financial assistance now and for the future. Following are some impressions which surfaced during the evaluation and actions which are presently being undertaken:

a. The Fundação Esperança, in Brazil, and the Health Ministry in Mozambique, Africa, have plans for continuing the presently successful training programs through "whatever" financial support they can obtain.

b. Guinea-Bissau appears to fall into a different category; its Ministry feels that foreign financial assistance should be 100%.

c. Núr University, in Bolivia, as an established, on-going, and growing university has already incorporated this graduate health management coursework into its regular course offerings; it has come to recognize its potential for expanding this "grass-roots" training and is actively seeking financial assistance to supplement student tuitions.

USAID's financial assistance, through Matching Grants I and II, has contributed considerably and positively to laying the groundwork for the establishment of institutional "training-for-development" bases in Brazil and Bolivia. The seeds have been planted; this human resource training effort by two well-founded, sensitive, and professional institutions, has started to show positive results; while it is evident in the short run, it will become more important in the long-run as these countries continue on the long journey to country development.

### IV. Methodology

Initial opening evaluation sessions, meetings, and discussions were held with management and administrative staff of the institutions concerned at all evaluation sites in Brazil, Bolivia,



and Mozambique; Guinea-Bissau was not visited since the review could be more easily accomplished in Mozambique and be more cost-effective.

A similar approach was taken in the review of all training materials, training guides and schedules, audio-visual aids, and class and workshop attendance records,

Subsequently, interview schedules were prepared to enable the Evaluator to visit, discuss and observe "in the training locale" the training environment, student disposition, and enthusiasm (or lack thereof) for the training being provided.

Although it was anticipated that this Evaluator would be provided with the results of the surveys and data collection prior to or upon his arrival, some data were gathered during his visits, and were not completed until after his return to home station.

In addition to the preliminary meetings which were held with personnel responsible for the management and administration of the training programs, traveled to outlying worksites and interviewed personnel who had taken one, several, or completed the training modules and/or workshops. The interviews had the objective of determining the extent to which training and material provided were being utilized, solicit comments concerning the quality of the training, how the trainer of trainers program was being promoted, solicit comments or suggestions for modification or improvement of the training, and to make an overall assessment of the degree of acceptance of the training programs being offered. The results of the interview are outlined in Appendix A.

## V. Findings

There was general consensus that Fundação Esperança and Esperança/Núr are doing an excellent job. This most salient finding can best be supported in terms of the unified clamor (during all meetings, discussions, and interviews) that: "we need more Esperanças"! Or, "Esperança must not leave Santarem"! In Bolivia, "we have come to know Esperança/Núr and want to continue to work with them" In Mozambique, a very strong support for Esperança's training activities was expressed by the National Director of Human Resources of the Ministry of Health who stated, "I will retain Ms. Rebello (Esperança's training representative) pending the renewal of the project or approval of the Fundação Esperança/Holland agreement". In addition, the Chief of Party of the University Research Corporation (URC) health project in Mozambique, was so well-pleased with the back-up support she received from Esperança's trainer that she contracted her to serve on her staff.

Specific findings and conclusions can be summarized, as follows:

A. Brazil Program

Findings:

(1) Comparison of the programmed DIP (Detailed Implementation Plan) Indicators with Total Outputs at the end of the project:

a. Total Output based on DIP Workshops:

|                     | Programmed | Achieved |
|---------------------|------------|----------|
| Modules:.....       | 36         | 40       |
| No. Participants:.. | 720        | 1,048    |
| No. Institutions:.. | 120        | 322      |

b. Total Number and Types of Institutions attended through workshops through the end of the project:

|                 |     |
|-----------------|-----|
| Government..... | 242 |
| NGOs.....       | 83  |
| Private.....    | 136 |

c. Overall total trained by the Center, number of institutions participating, and distribution by sex in the Specialized Course of the FE Centro Técnico Vocacional - Program of Human Resources Development:

Total Trained by the Center..... 1,570

d. Institutions Participating in Specialized Courses:

|                 |    |
|-----------------|----|
| Autonomous..... | 5  |
| Public.....     | 50 |
| NGOs.....       | 12 |
| Private.....    | 19 |

Number of Students Registered vs Completion in Specialized Courses:

|                  |    |
|------------------|----|
| Registered.....  | 90 |
| Graduated.....   | 79 |
| % Completed..... | 88 |

Male vs Female: Specialized Courses:

|             |    |        |
|-------------|----|--------|
| Male.....   | 15 | (19%)  |
| Female..... | 64 | (81%)  |
| Total.....  | 79 | (100%) |

e. Total Output based on DIP Public Health Modules  
Programmed      Achieved

|                     |     |       |       |
|---------------------|-----|-------|-------|
| Modules.....        | 18  | ..... | 40    |
| No. Participants... | 440 | ..... | 1,048 |
| No. Institutions... | 60  | ..... | 322   |

(2) Course material was reviewed in detail. Particular emphasis was placed on analyzing it to determine whether it responded to the needs of the institutions and complied with the objectives of the Cooperative Agreement. In this respect, it should be noted that the Fundação Esperança was very sensitive to and exercised extreme care to assure that the integrity of the agreement was maintained and the recipients of the training were profiting from the "grass roots" training.

(3) As can be deduced from the comments advanced during the interviews (Appendix A), students who completed the various courses and were operating in their own working environment, almost unanimously concluded that their training at Esperança had "mentally" motivated them to proceed to apply and implement what they had learned without undue hesitation. They appeared to have more confidence in their abilities to plan and make decisions.

(4) By extension, institutions which recognized the value of the training at FE, made extreme efforts to send most of their key employees to train at FE. Of course, lack of sufficient funding, at times, precluded larger numbers to attend. Some stated that they were studying ways of satisfying this need.

(5) With respect to cost recovery, FE has, during the life of the project, recovered course costs per year at 25%, 35%, 80%, to 100%, vice the DIP which had set the figures at 10%, 25%, 40%, and 60%. The selling of modules, and other training material, is a practical approach, particularly since the subjects are up-to-date and relate to the needs of the region. However, there is a drawback, the material is neither in book nor manual form. Arrangements, and funding, should be made available to publish this material as soon as possible. It would enable, particularly those who cannot attend the courses, to purchase them to study on their own time and within the confines of their respective working environments.

NOTE: With respect to funding of training through municipalities, this Consultant apprised the FE Management of an existing Brazilian Fundo de Participação for Municípios. He worked very closely with this fund during his 6-year tenure in Northeast Brazil (an area with 1,400 municípios). The fund is maintained by the Central Bank of Brazil to provide funds to Municipalities which can identify and support economic and social development projects within their respective boundaries. These projects require good planning and justification.

(6) Esperança has already established itself as a serious and sensitive professional training institution. Ample proof already exists to warrant this classification. Therefore, organizations which become acquainted with it, and see the results achieved would not, in the opinion of this Consultant, hesitate to provide funding to support training for their staffs.

#### B. Bolivia Program:

NOTE: Under separate cover is a companion report to this evaluation, entitled "Evaluación Preliminar Final Proyecto Desarrollo Recursos Humanos en Salud - Matching Grant II, dated July, 1997. It was prepared in the Esperanza/Bolivia Office, at Tarija, Bolivia, by Ms. M. Vargas, the Esperanza/Bolivia professional assigned to assist this Consultant during his visit to Esperança/Núr in Bolivia. It alludes to the fact that one of the major weaknesses encountered in carrying out the preliminary evaluation process was the non-systematic organization of the data by Núr University. Nevertheless, this Consultant has extracted and consolidated the main elements to provide a ready reading of the impact of the Esperança/Núr project effort.

#### ===== Findings:

(a) Workshop Impact Indicators: Combines the data from Santa Cruz, Cochabamba, and Tarija.

| Workshop                   | Female |    | Male |    | Overall |
|----------------------------|--------|----|------|----|---------|
|                            | No.    | %  | No.  | %  | Total   |
| 1. Pers Mgt & Development  | 50     | 63 | 30   | 37 | 80      |
| 2. Strategic Planning      | 8      | 36 | 14   | 64 | 22      |
| 3. Project Design          | 9      | 35 | 17   | 65 | 26      |
| 4. Community Participation | 27     | 63 | 16   | 37 | 43      |
| 5. Project Evaluation      | 5      | 45 | 6    | 55 | 11      |
| 6. Quick Studies APS       | 17     | 57 | 13   | 43 | 30      |
| 7. Participatory Research  | 26     | 43 | 34   | 57 | 60      |
| 8. NGO Admin Structure     | 9      | 47 | 10   | 53 | 19      |
| 9. Leadership/Supervision  | 19     | 37 | 32   | 63 | 51      |
| 10. Training of Trainers   | 21     | 60 | 14   | 40 | 35      |
| 11. Development Concepts   | 6      | 32 | 13   | 68 | 19      |
| Totals                     | 197    | 47 | 199  | 53 | 396     |

=====

(b) DIP Indicator I: Thirteen 24-hour sessions for Training of Trainers for NGOs during the 5 years of the project.

| Programmed | Achieved | % Accomplished |
|------------|----------|----------------|
| 14         | 15       | 107.1          |

(c) DIP Indicator 2: Seventy-eight (78) participants in Training of Trainers for NGOs during the 5 years of the project.

| Programmed | Achieved | % Accomplished |
|------------|----------|----------------|
| 78         | 34       | 43.6           |

(d) DIP Indicator 3: Fifty (50) workshops for NGOs for the 3 Departments of Tarija, Cochabamba, and Santa Cruz (Results consolidated below).

| Programmed | Achieved | % Accomplished |
|------------|----------|----------------|
| 50         | 53       | 106.0          |

(e) Impact Indicators: 50% of the participants in the Public Health Modules are from the National Secretariat of Health. Other participants are from Social Security, NGOs, Private Sector, University, and several independents. The three (3) Departments of Santa Cruz, Cochabamba, and Tarija are consolidated below.

| Module No.  | No. Participants |
|---|------------------|
| 1. Public Health Administration.....                  | 89               |
| 2. Management of Health Systems.....                  | 76               |
| 3. Health Program Planning .....                      | 83               |
| 4. Implementation & Control of Health Programs.....   | 81               |
| 5. Human Resource Management & Information Systems... | 98               |
| 6. Financial Management of Health Systems .....       | 79               |
| Total.....  | 506              |

(f) Impact Indicator: 50% of the women participating in the different public health modules.

| Module No.    | Female |      | Male |      | Total |       |
|---------------|--------|------|------|------|-------|-------|
|               | No.    | %    | No.  | %    | No.   | %     |
| All 6 Modules | 297    | 56.5 | 209  | 43.5 | 506   | 100.0 |

(g) Impact Indicator 1: 18 workshops in Trainer of Trainers in Public Health Administration and Management. Totals for the five (5) years of the project are consolidated for the three (3) Departments of Tarija, Cochabamba, and Santa Cruz.

| Programmed | Achieved | %    |
|------------|----------|------|
| 18         | 2        | 11.1 |

=====  
(h) Impact Indicator 2: 216 participants in Trainer of Trainers in Public Health Administration and Management. Total for the five (5) years of the project are consolidated for the three (3) Departments of Tarija, Cochabamba, and Santa Cruz.

| Programmed | Achieved | %    |
|------------|----------|------|
| 216        | 30       | 13.9 |

=====  
(i) Impact Indicator 3: Implementation of 2 modules per year in Public Health Administration and Management in three (3) regions (Tarija, Cochabamba, and Santa Cruz).

| Programmed | Achieved | %     |
|------------|----------|-------|
| 18         | 18       | 100.0 |

=====  
(j) Impact Indicator 4: Thirty (30) participants per module by region (Tarija, Cochabamba, and Santa Cruz) .

| Programmed | Achieved | %    |
|------------|----------|------|
| 540        | 506      | 93.7 |

=====  
(k) Impact Indicator: % of participants in the 6 MAPH modules according to professional category, and consolidated by regions (Tarija, Cochabamba, and Santa Cruz).

|                     |       |       |
|---------------------|-------|-------|
| Doctors.....        | 12 or | 13.3% |
| Nurses.....         | 8 or  | 8.9%  |
| Biochemists.....    | 1 or  | 1.1%  |
| Total.. 21 or 23.3% |       |       |

(2) Reviewed all available published and loose leaf course material. However, Núr's excellent standing and reputation in the professional community enabled it to secure funding for publishing an 11-Module series to train leaders and agents in community participation and development. These, and other didactic material reviewed, revealed a most sensitive approach to training leaders to identify and respond to community needs. On-site interviews revealed that Núr's training materials were being used extensively by managers and supervisors in carrying out in-house training of their subordinates.

(3) Núr's reputation as a training institution is well-described in comments advanced by personnel interviewed (Appendix A).

(4) Cost recovery becomes a somewhat easier matter for Esperança/Núr in Bolivia. The Bolivian Government has come to realize the benefits it can derive from the funding of local private and public institutions to support its economic and social development efforts.

Also, in talking with students, while some would pay the full tuition, many are more disposed to pay a portion of their tuition. Therefore, it is recommended that funding sources be explored to assure that this type of training is continued. As a start, the Government of Bolivia should be presented with a plan or program which demonstrates how this type of training inputs into the country's development process. It should be made aware (and see) how the training will assist to lay the administrative and management foundation on which country development can be accelerated. One, two, or three-way funding should be carefully studied and analyzed.

Depending on the situation, the Government should either fund the training required completely, or share training expenses with students, or, as a final resort, design a formula whereby the Government, Students, and an International Organization share the training and institutional development on a 3:2:1 basis, in that order. For example, a training expense of \$500.00 is divided by 6 and the resultant amount multiplied by 3 for the Government, by 2 for the Student, and 1 for the International Organization. This approach has worked elsewhere.

#### C. Mozambique Program

Findings: Overall, Officials at the Ministry of Health and the Institute of Health Sciences were very well impressed with the technical and training assistance which the Fundação Esperança/Brazil. They are seeking ways of retaining them to continue with the training efforts which have been initiated. Because of their 10-year (1992-2002) national human resources development plan, they would like for FE to return and concentrate

on the Trainer of Trainers program. This is their greatest need because of a lack of a large number of trained civil servants.

(a) Product Indicators for Workshops

|                                     | Programmed | Achieved |
|-------------------------------------|------------|----------|
| 1. Total Workshops Conducted.....   | 12 .....   | 12       |
| 2. Total No. of Participants.....   | 120 .....  | 90       |
| 3. Total Institutions Assisted..... | 15 .....   | 5        |
| 4. No. of Modules Developed.....    | 4 .....    | 6        |
| 5. No. of Participants/Module.....  | 20 .....   | 22       |
| 6. No. of Organizations/Module..... | 15 .....   | 3        |

=====

(b) Impact Indicators for Workshops

|   | Programmed | Achieved |
|---|------------|----------|
| 1. No. of Health Organizations.....       | 15 .....   | 3        |
| 2. Average No. of Participants/Workshop.. | 15 .....   | 18       |

(c) Although not completely verified, there appear to be some 30 to 40 Doctors and Nurses who are potentially ready to undertake or are taking specialized training toward a degree, as required by law. Fundação Esperança initially developed the 6-module course for the Ministry of Health.

The 6-module FE Specialized (8-month-fulltime) Course in Public Health Administration has been introduced and is in the process of being approved, contingent upon allocation of the necessary funding.

(d) As to cost recovery or financial sustainability, the Ministry of Health does not appear to have the necessary funds to satisfy the Government's needs in this area. It is seeking financial assistance from other Donor Organizations, i.e., Switzerland, Holland, etc.

During the life of the FE project, the Ministry of Health has been responsible for the defraying the room and board of the FE Staff, as well as the room, board, travel, and local transportation of the students. How long this will continue is not known; they are studying possible alternatives.

(e) There is a strong desire on the part of the Government of Mozambique to accelerate the 10-year human resources development plan. Donor organizations should sit with the GOM to assess the extent to which the GOM can finance this training, and assist it with whatever else is needed. The present National Director of Human Resources for the MOH appears to be a most conscientious, practical, and decision-minded person who, if given technical and financial assistance will make programs move.



#### D. Guinea-Bissau Program

Findings: NOTE: This Consultant did not visit Guinea-Bissau. To travel there would not be a cost-effective situation. As a result, program activities were discussed with the FE representatives while in Mozambique.

(a) Indicators: Although twelve (12) workshops were programmed, the program was closed with only 7 training workshops being conducted by trainers from Brazil.

(b) Program was closed because the Government of Guinea-Bissau was not able to meet its counterpart funding; in fact, it was asking the FE to meet all expenses.

(c) It appears that some closer meeting of the minds or negotiations is required in order to determine the extent to which FE can continue to carry out its training activities in Guinea-Bissau. This is another country that badly needs the type of "grass-roots" training that FE can provide.

#### VI. Overall Conclusion

This Consultant was most pleased to have had the opportunity to be called upon to evaluate this type of program. The work that the Fundação Esperança and Núr University are carrying out, merits the highest recognition and congratulations. More so, since they represent two active local Democratic Institutions in Development, as defined in Title IX of our U.S. Foreign Assistance Act of 1996 - Utilization of Democratic Institutions in Development.

These two institutions are well-respected for their professional contribution to the development of human resources in areas which most countries need, - health and community participation and development.

Additionally, their unselfish devotion to become involved in the training of the most underprivileged persons, attests to their understanding of human wants and desires.

#### VII. Recommendations

Only two intertwined recommendations are made: 1) that lesser developed Portuguese and Spanish-speaking countries be informed of the existence of these two organizations, and, 2) that individual or multiple sources of financing be explored which can provide the financial assistance needed to train the human resources in developing countries, particularly concentrating on training of trainers and the basics of administration and management.

## PERSONNEL CONTACTED AND INTERVIEWS HELD

### A. BRAZIL:

#### 1. Evaluation Team:

- a) Dr. Fred Hartman, M.D., Consultant  
Esperança, Inc.
- b) Dr. Vera Luce Canto Bertagnolli  
Director, Human Resources Development Program  
Fundação Esperança, Santarém, Para
- c) James J. Villalobos, Consultant  
AMA Technologies, Inc.

#### 2. Personnel Interviewed:

- a. Dr. Valdina Mario de Jesus Moreira  
"Coordenadora da Fundação de Saúde de Santarém"  
Secretaria de Saúde de Monte Alegre  
Took the "Mestrado em Gestão" course.  
Focal comments: "Fundação Esperança is doing a great job; need more Esperanças!"
- b. Ireno Lima  
"Pesquisador Area Social"  
Took the "Mestrado em Gestão" course  
Focal comments: More assured of himself and concludes that the 19 municipalities in the region need the training Esperança is providing, i.e., FE is doing a great job.
- c. Irene Bello Gonçalves Zampietro  
"Gerente de Vendas (Passagens Aérea)"  
Professora na Universidade Luterana (Redação e Literatura)  
Focal comments: Discovered Esperança and continues studying there. Took the 7-module training. Five of her professor colleagues are pursuing the "Mestrado em Gestão" course. Esperança must not leave Santarém!  
Recommends: Increase the number of seminars and workshops and also add new ones. They provide added knowhow to professors.

## APPENDIX A

- d. Áurea Lucia Días Alexander  
"Secretaria Municipal de Saúde (Santarém)"  
Took 3 workshops. The Planning Workshop was very good, and the instructor was well-versed and lucid. Presently, 20 are pursuing the "Auxiliadora de Enfermagem" training. Recommends that Esperança's seminars and work shops be increased.
- e. Dra. Francisca Douro Carvalho  
"Técnica em Segurança de Trabalho"  
Companhia Elétrica de Pará  
Took the "Primeiros Socorros" and "Educação à Distancia". Five others from her organization also took the "Primeiros Socorros" training. Recommends: Need more FEs; courses are practical and work-needs directed; she wants to send more of her employees to FE's workshops.
- f. Nadine Pedroso de Souza.  
Diretora, Centro de Reabilitação da Associação dos Pais e Amigos Excepcionais de Santarém (APAE).  
Comments: The region lacks qualified human resources. FE's excellent training approach can help reduce this. Twenty (20), from her organization, have already taken the "Organizational Planning" training. She took 5 workshops and has used extensively Administrative Planning and Estrategic Planning. She is also pursuing the "Mestrado em Gestão" course.
- g. Sergio Furtado, Professor/Bio-Químico, Faculdade Integrada de Tapajoj. Took the "Administração e Saúde" training and recommends that FE be provided additional financial support; the region cannot afford to be without "Esperança".
- h. Ivaneldo Malheiros Monteiro. Former Secretario da Secretaria de Saúde Pública; presently, Secretario da Secretaria de Segurança Pública. Comments: An existing necessity compelled him and 3 others to take the "Programação e Administração" Training at FE. This training has helped considerably. It should be extended to the surrounding regional municipalities (19). FE is a serious organization and should be strengthened.
- i. Dra. Teresinha de Socorro Barreiro, Chefe da Unidade do Banco de Sangue.  
Member of the first group to take the "Planejamento e Administração" Training at FE. The course was most important. It gave her the tools needed to plan and carry out her work. She planned and implemented the first blood bank in Pará. She's getting ready to open new blood banks throughout the state of Pará. This, she

considers is the result of her acquired self assurance in planning and administering. Even now, after 3 years, she still uses the knowledge she acquired during her training at FE. It would have been very difficult, if not at all, to accomplish what she has 'til now.

B. BOLIVIA:

1. Evaluation Team:

- a. James J. Villalobos, Consultant  
AMA Technologies, Inc.
- b. Ms. Miriam Vargas Vargas, Consultant  
Esperanza, Bolivia

2. Officials Contacted (Universidad NUR):

a. Junta Fiduciaria:

- (1) Dr. Eloy Anello Rodriguez, Presidente
- (2) Dr. William Baker, Vicepresidente

b. Rectorado:

- (1) Ing. Manoutchehr Shoaie, Rector

c. Direcciones:

- (1) Ing. Soheil Dooki, Colegio de Postgrado
- (2) Lic. Jeremy Martin, Desarrollo Institucional

d. Coordinador de Carreras a Nivel Postgrado:

- (1) Dr. William Baker, Salud Pública

e. Coordinadora de Servicios Académicos:

- (1) Lic. Crystal Baker

f. Coordinadora de Servicios Administrativos:

- (1) Lic. Patricia Lastra, Finanzas

3. Met with an Official of the Prefectura del Departamento de Santa Cruz:

- (a) Lic. Teresa Trigoyen Morales, Directora Departamental de la Prefectura del Departamento de Santa Cruz. The purpose of our visit was to solicit copies of national development plans which could serve as a tie-in with the FE/NUR training programs. Once having established who we

were and the reason for our visit, she readily volunteered to inform us, first of all, that she was well-acquainted with the fine work that FE/NUR was doing in improving the administration and management of human resources in Bolivia. Without hesitation she provided us with copies of:

- 1) Ley 1551 de Participación Popular, 20 de abril de 1994;
- 2) Plan Departamental de Desarrollo de Santa Cruz, 1997;
- 3) Programa de Acciones Estratégicas Productivas, 1997;
- 4) Programa de Acciones Estratégicas en Recursos Naturales, Medio Ambiente y Planificación del Desarrollo, 1997;
- 5) Plan de Acciones Estratégicas (1996-1997), de la Secretaría Nacional de Salud, Ministerio de Desarrollo Humano, República de Bolivia; and,
- 6) The Programa de Acciones Estratégicas para el Desarrollo Humano (1997).

She expressed a desire to work closer with FE/NUR training activities, particularly with respect as to how the training would tie into the national development plans.

### 3. Personnel Interviewed:

- a. Dr. Jesus Montero, Responsable, Area de Salud Pública, Centro Experimental Agrícola Campesino. Took the "Organización y Planificación", "Manejo de Recursos Humanos", "Planificación y Seguimiento", y "Conformación de Equipos" Training. Comments: found them excellent; changed his whole mental attitude; re-directed his thinking processes; improved his management of human resources; and now knows how to proceed. In fact, he is now "easily" (with more confidence) preparing his Annual Operational Plan for 1997. His area of responsibility covers some 9,300 inhabitants.
- b. Mr. Martin Martinez, Administrador, CARITAS Boliviana. Participated in the FE "Manejo de Recursos Humanos". However, since several years had passed since he took the course, he appeared rather unsure of how, or if,

the training had or is assisting him. No further comments were offered. CARITAS appears to be doing its own inhouse training.

- c. Silvia Vaca, Directora, Artesanía Cruceña del Campo. Commented, rather enthusiastically and affirmatively, concerning the positive results which she has received from the training in several of the FE/NUR training. "Organización y Planificación" seems to be the training that has given her a wider perspective in administering and managing the Artesanía, a program that involves many peasant communities throughout Bolivia. She recommends rather strongly that FE/NUR continue with, and even increase the number of workshops, seminars, and other institutional strengthening training programs. She feels that this type of training goes to the core of human resource improvement.
- d. Lic. Josefina García, Directora, Centro de Mujeres Rurales (CEMUR). She depicts a most sensitive and efficient person. She seems to organize and plan well. She has taken several FE/NUR training courses and, depending on funds available, she sends as many of her people to the "Treinador de Treinadores" courses. She considers FE/NUR as a well established trainer of trainers institution. In fact, many of her FE/NUR-trained trainers have provided quite a few training sessions for the women in the Center. Examples of training they have provided are: "Organización", "Planificación Estratégica", "Liderazgo Moral", "Marco Conceptual", "La Consulta, Misión y Visión", "Análisis Contextual", y "FODA" (Fortalezas, Oportunidades, Debilidades, Amenazas). Recommends that FE/NUR not only continue, but extend and expand its operations.
- e. Ing. Hugo Navia M., Director, Centro de Educación y Desarrollo Integral del Campesino. He has personally taken several training workshops and has sent some of his people to do as well. He likes the training approach used; it is practical and down to earth. He wishes that more training funds were available to help him send more of his key personnel to the "Treinador de Treinadores" and "Planificación y Administración" courses.

C. MOZAMBIQUE:

1. Evaluation Team:

- (a) James J. Villalobos, Consultant  
AMA Technologies, Inc.

- (b) Vera Luce Canto Bertagnolli,  
Director, Human Resources Development Program  
Fundação Esperança, Santarém, Pará, Brazil
- (c) Jalba Lillian Rebello, Consultant  
Fundação Esperança, Santarém, Pará, Brazil

2. Officials Contacted:

- (a) Lic. Lucas Chomera Jeremias, Director Nacional de Recursos Humanos, Ministério da Saúde. Supports rather strongly the FE training activities; wants them to continue. Since FE program is terminating, his concern is that Ms. Rebello will be leaving. However, pending the approval of an FE-Holland training proposal, he stated that he would want to retain Ms. Rebello during the interim period. There is no doubt that he wants FE to continue its training activities in Mozambique, particularly in view of the 10-year (1992-2002) national human resources development plan. His conclusion is that the greatest need at present is the "training of trainers"; therefore, a stronger emphasis should be given to the training of trainers (TOT) in all areas of administration and management.
- (b) Dr. Caetano Maria Pereira, Director, Instituto das Ciências da Saúde do Ministério da Saúde. FE training program carried out and coordinated through this institute. The Director is well-pleased with the way the program is being administered and coordinated. Ms. Rebello, from FE, oversees the entire operation.
- (c) Nurse Lágrima Fabião Mausse, from the Instituto das Ciências da Saúde, is presently coordinating the "Administração e Ensino" course. A review of the record-keeping revealed that she has it well under control. The training started on August 28, 1996, and 22 of the original 25 participants are expected to complete the 1,640 training hours.
- (d) Ms. Mary Ann Abeyta-Behnke, Chief-of-Party of the University Research Corporation (URC) from Bethesda, Maryland. She is well-pleased with the back-up support which the FE training program has provided to her health administration project. So much so, that she contracted one of FE's trainers to serve on her staff, Ms. Linda Nor from Santarém, Pará, Brazil.

3. Personnel Interviewed:

- (a) Ms. Fátima Ricardito, Professora do Instituto. Her remarks are based on one seminar. She feels that this type of training should continue; that it attains positive results.
- (b) Dra. Angélica Salomão, Directora, Centro Regional de Desenvolvimento Sanitario. Although she proceeded to explain her ideas for reorganizing the Centro, she nevertheless had some comments to make concerning the training she and several of her subordinates had taken at the FE-Instituto de Ciências. The training was adequate, but a lack of sufficient funding for the training (in her opinion) appeared to be her biggest complaint. She left this Consultant with an impression that she can do anything better.
- (c) Manuel Ernesto Muanga, Chefe, Repartição de Saúde da Comunidade da Provincia de Gaza. Took the "Aviação de Desempenho" and "Organização e Administração", two programs which have helped him considerably in carrying out his administrative functions. We observed his planning and activities charts which were well lined up on the wall of his office. He would like to take other courses, funds permitting. He stated that 3 others from the Province had also taken FE courses and were performing well in their jobs.
- (d) Fernando Novela, Chefe, Planejamento e Cooperação. Took the "Planejamento e Supervisão" e "Gestão" courses. Feels that the courses were very good, but too short; needed more discussion and more time to digest information. He is now trying to develop and implement a Group Participation seminar. Realizes that training is a never-ending necessity. FE should continue.
- (e) Alberto Benedito Mobate, Chefe, Programa de Vacinação. He feels he benefitted greatly from the "Supervisão e Gestão" course which he took. It was practical, good and valid. It gave him more positive ideas on how to program and the sensitivities required in supervision, i.e., reduces situations to more systematic approaches. Would like to participate in other courses.
- (f) Abner Paulo Manjate, Sistema de Informação de Saúde. Took three courses: "Planificação", "Supervisão e Gestão", and "Treinador de Treinadores". However, he did not appear to have grasped the real objective of



the training. For example, he stated that he had his "own" way/method of supervising. Upon further (and rather intensive) discussion, this Consultant established that Mr. Manjate is still holding on to the "Boss-Worker" relationship, i.e., strictly top-down communication. A concluding short discussion ensued to get at what "human sensitivity" was all about. It seemed that finally he recognized and accepted the more "democratic-two-way-open" communication. Again, and unfortunately, it appears that he did not get/grasp the full meaning of the training he received.

D. GUINEA-BISSAU (Did not go there).

## LIST OF MATERIALS REVIEWED AND/OR STUDIED

### A. UMBRELLA DOCUMENTS:

1. USAID Cooperative Agreement No. PDC-0158-00-1101-00, dated September 30, 1991, and subsequent Amendments.
2. USAID Cooperative Agreement No. FAO-0500-A-00-3019-00, dated August 20, 1993.
3. Hartman-Anello Mid-Term Evaluation of Human Health Resource Development in Latin America and Africa, Esperança Matching Grant II (PDC-0158-A-00-1101-00, dated June, 1994.
4. Final Evaluation Esperança, Inc. "South-South Health Training Program", Bolivia, OTR-0158-A-00-8262-00 (8/88 - 9/91).
5. Sustainability Plan for Bolivia, Esperança, Inc./Nur University, Matching Grant II, Health Human Resources Development Project.
6. Matching Grant Annual Report, Human Resource Development for Health, MG #PDC-0158-A-00-1100-00, dated December, 1995.
7. FY 1991 MATCHING GRANT APPLICATION (Brazil, Bolivia, Mozambique, & Guinea-Bissau).
8. APPLICATION TO U.S. AID MATCHING GRANT - FISCAL YEAR 1991, REVISION OF BUDGET TABLES, May 13, 1991.
9. The DIPs (Detailed Implementation Plans for Bolivia, Brazil, Mozambique, and Guinea-Bissau).

### B. BRAZIL (Cross-Sample of Material Reviewed):

1. Programa de Desenvolvimento de Recursos Humanos, "Recursos Humanos (O Mais Rico Patrimônio)", Fundação Esperança.
2. Anais da 2nda. Conferencia AIM na América Latina na Região Amazônica, 1994.
3. Programa de Workshops:
  - a. Curso Básico de Planejamento e Programação (Noções Básicas de Planejamento).

## APPENDIX B

- b. Planejamento Estratégico, 22 à 25 de Junho de 1993 e 13 à 15 de Dezembro de 1994, Santarém, Pará.
  - c. Gestão, 30 de março de 1997.
  - d. Gerência de Qualidade, 7 à 10 de junho de 1994.
  - e. Supervisão, Abril, 1997.
  - f. Desenho, Execução e Avaliação, de 17 à 20 de Agosto de 1993.
  - g. Método "PBL" (Processo de Solução de Problemas), Abril, 1997.
4. Curso Preparatório Para Provas de Auxiliar de Enfermagem, "Enfermagem Neuro-Psiquiátra", Abril, 1997.
    - a. Atitudes de Cidadania, Abril, 1997.
    - b. Queimaduras, Março, 1997.
    - c. Psicologia Aplicada e Ética Profissional, Abril, 1997.
    - d. Noções de Administração em Unidades de Enfermagem, Abril, 1997.
  5. Programa de Educação à Distancia: Uma Nova Alternativa, Fundação Esperança, 1966.
  6. Programa de Treinamento de Treinadores (Cursos Técnicos), Fundação Esperança, Março, 1996.

NOTE: Most of the above material is in loose-leaf form; the FE is seeking financing to print and publish the modules and training material. Eventhough the Fundação has been gaining the reputation of a sensitive, serious, and professional "grass-roots" training institution, having its material printed and published in some kind of "book-form" would contribute considerably to promote the training in a more professional manner.

C. BOLIVIA (Cross-sample Nur University - Fundação Esperança):

1. Programa de Acciones Estratégicas de Participación Popular de la Prefectura de Santa Cruz, 1997. Action document which delineates the Government's policy concerning the Development of Human Resources, Community Participation, and Administrative Descentralization.

2. República de Bolivia, Ministerio de Desarrollo Humano, Secretaría Nacional de Salud (Plan de Acciones Estratégicas (1996 - 1997)).
3. Ley 1551 de Participación Popular (20 de abril de 1994).
4. Plan Departamental de Desarrollo de Santa Cruz, 1996. The Plan addresses the Department's strategy and policy for the development of its human resources, to enable it to manage and use its natural and environmental resources.
5. Programa de Acciones Estratégicas en Recursos Naturales, Medio Ambiente y Planificación del Desarrollo. Action document which addresses, inter alia, the participatory process to enable peasant communities, tribal peoples, groups, other social organizations, etc. to participate in decisions concerning development priorities and the application of resources to priority projects which respond to the needs of the communities of the nation.

NOTE: The above documents provide the basis and outline the parameters within which the development of a more systematic approach in planning, implementing, and evaluating human resources training programs to Municipalities and ONGs can take place; more importantly, they provide the necessary support to seek financial assistance.

6. The nine of twelve modules written by Núr University to Train Community Development Agents/Rural Trainers, are as follows:
  - a. Liderazgo Moral (Module 1)
  - b. Conceptos de Aprendizaje y Desarrollo (Module 2)
  - c. Participación Comunitaria (Module 3)
  - d. Capacitación de Adultos (Module 4)
  - e. Areas Programáticas del Desarrollo (Module 5)
  - f. Planificación Estratégica (Module 6)
  - g. Diseño de Proyectos (Module 8)
  - h. El Trabajo en Equipo (Module 10)
  - i. Evaluación para el Aprendizaje Colectivo (Module 12)

NOTE: The printing and publication of the twelve modules was financed by the Fondo de Inversión Social.

7. Magister en Salúd Pública (con mención en Gerência en Sistemas de Salúd), Universidad Núr, Colegio de Postgrado
  8. Cáritas Boliviana, Estudio Sobre Areas de Pobreza Rural en Bolivia, Febrero, 1992.
- D. GUINEA-BISSAU and MOZAMBIQUE: Most of the same material as prepared for and in Brazil, with the exception of:
1. Relações Interpessoais, Faculdade de Medicina/Fundação Esperança (Diretoria de Desenvolvimento de Recursos Humanos), Maputo, Mozambique, 1996.
  2. Sumario do Curriculum do Curso Médio Especializado em: Administração e Ensino, Minesterio da Saúde, Instituto de Ciências de Saúde de Maputo/Fundação Esperança, Maputo, 1996.
  3. Plano Nacional de Desenvolvimento de Recursos Humanos, 1992/2002, Maputo, Mozambique. This document identifies the pervasive human resources problems; however, it does not outline a systematic short or long-term approach to planning and implementing a series of resolutions to reduce them.

## LIST OF ACRONYMS USED IN THE REPORT

|             |  |
|-------------|--|
| AFINCO..... | Administração e Finanças Para o Desenvolvimento Comunitario (Manual de Sistemas de Administração Financeira Para ONGs Ambientais). |
| AIM.....    | Action in International Medicine (London)  |
| AUPHA.....  | Asociación de Universidades con Programas en Administración de Salud   |
| CBA.....    | Cochabamba, Bolivia  |
| CDC.....    | Center for Disease Control   |
| CEMUR.....  | Centro de Mujeres Rurales  |
| DIP.....    | Detailed Implementation Plan   |
| FE.....     | Fundação Esperança   |
| FIS.....    | Fondo de Inversión Social  |
| FVA.....    | Food and Voluntary Agencies  |
| HSM.....    | Health Systems Management  |
| MAPH.....   | Management, Administration & Public Health   |
| MCH.....    | Maternal & Child Health  |
| MGI.....    | Matching Grant I   |
| MGII.....   | Matching Grant II  |
| MPH.....    | Masters of Public Health   |
| MOH.....    | Ministry of Health   |
| NGO.....    | Non-Governmental Organization  |
| NUR.....    | Universidad Nur, Bolivia   |
| OPA.....    | Operating Program Grant  |
| PGC.....    | Post Graduate College, Universidad Nur   |
| PIE .....   | Planning, Implementation & Evaluation  |
| PRODES....  | Post Graduate Program in Latin American Development  |
| PROSALUD..  | Private Health Service Delivery & Training Agency, Santa Cruz, Bolivia   |
| PVC.....    | Private & Voluntary Cooperatives   |
| PVO.....    | Private Voluntary Organization   |
| SCZ.....    | Santa Cruz, Bolivia  |
| TOT.....    | Training of Trainers   |
| TRJ.....    | Tarija, Bolivia  |
| UNAMA.....  | Universidade de Amazonia   |
| UNICEF..... | U.N. Institute for Childrens' Education Fund   |
| USAID.....  | U.S. Agency for International Development  |
| FE.....     | Fundação Esperança   |
| TOT.....    | Training of Trainers   |
| PVO.....    | Private Voluntary Organization   |
| NGO.....    | Non-Governmental Organization  |
| MPH.....    | Masters of Public Health   |
| MOH.....    | Ministry of Health   |
| DIP.....    | Detailed Implementation Plan   |
| USAID.....  | U.S. Agency for International Development  |

## APPENDIX C

SCOPE OF WORK FOR FINAL EVALUATION  
OF  
ESPERANÇA COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT PDC-0158-A-00-1101-00

**1. ACTIVITY TO BE EVALUATED:** Esperança has been carrying out a health education program in the following countries:

- A. Bolivia, since 1988, collaborating with University Nur;
- B. Brazil, collaborating with Fundação Esperança;
- C. Mozambique and Guinea-Bissau, Africa, collaborating with the Health Ministries of those countries.

The training program has several dimensions:

- (1) Formal, even a degree-granting level of education. A Masters in Public Health is granted in Bolivia upon completion of the course work, and graduate degree credit is also granted in Brazil.
- (2) Aside from these more formal programs, intensive weekend workshops have been given for NGOs in Bolivia, and vocational training is available in Brazil.

The overall objective of this training is to improve the host country capabilities, and especially to strengthen institutions which carry out public health work. The first Matching Grant ran from 1988 to 1991 (Bolivia and Guinea-Bissau), and the current Matching Grant, subject of this evaluation, was a five-year grant, recently extended for a sixth year, and involves activities in Bolivia, Brazil, Mozambique and Guinea-Bissau. (The latter is a limited effort: approximately six workshops).

**2. BACKGROUND:** The goals and objectives of this project work have varied by culture and country:

- A. Bolivia: Two needs were addressed in the original program planning:

- (1) Physicians, administrators and other workers in health, many from the Government Ministries, but some from private clinics, need training in managing preventive and public health work. A local collaborator was developed (University Nur), which would provide a local institution for carrying the training programs beyond the life of the grant.

- (2) It was found desirable to offer weekend workshops for management personnel in the growing population of local Bolivian NGOs. This part of the program was confined to intensive weekend workshops.

APPENDIX D

B. Brazil: The Fundação Esperança is an independent legal entity in Brazil (and a Brazilian NGO). With a long tradition in health treatment programs, as well as health education. An additional training facility was built to accommodate the training made possible by this Matching Grant. Initially, the training was for management personnel and/or physicians. The course work offered at the Fundação leads to a degree in "specialization", an intermediate step between Bachelors and Masters, and more recently, a Masters Degree program has been devised. Additionally, in the later phase of this grant, vocational education courses have been offered, with a strong response from the community (both levels: graduate and vocational).

C. Africa: In Mozambique, the training is essentially geared for the Ministry of Health personnel in the capital city of Maputo. The same is true in Bissau, the Capital of Guinea-Bissau, where workshops are being offered in the final year of the grant. Some items which have emerged are: strong response from the communities, over-subscription of courses, Bolivia much further along, with a total of eight years' funding, and have been without funding from this grant since early 1996. Brazil was the next country to undertake the training programs, and has had great success in marketing and attracting students. Since the Fundação Esperança is not, itself, an educational institution, a collaboration has been devised with degree-seeking institutions to award graduate degree credit. The Africa phase was initiated more recently, and is still evolving. There, too, there is a great desire for continuing the training.

**3. EXISTING PERFORMANCE INFORMATION SOURCES.** There is a mid-term evaluation which has been forwarded to the outside evaluator, Dr. Jim Villalobos. In addition, there have been regular progress reports from the field to Esperança headquarters, although much of this is very general in nature. This information, also, will be forwarded to Dr. Villalobos. Customer surveys were an important part of the mid-term evaluation.

**4. PURPOSE OF EVALUATION.** The evaluation is required under the Cooperative Agreement, so naturally, one audience for the evaluation is USAID itself. In addition, of course, the evaluation will be useful to Esperança and its collaborating institutions. University Nur, for example, is an on-going university which has incorporated this graduate health management coursework into its regular course offerings. The Fundação Esperança and the Health Ministries in Africa also have plans to continue the course work by one means or another. The evaluation will be useful to them.

**5. GOALS:** To assess the effectiveness of the training program, to enhance the activities of host public health organizations and individuals to improve the basic health of the population and to be more effective in achieving the goals of "health for all by the year 2000".



6. **OBJECTIVES:** The objectives of the evaluation are to:

- a. assess the applicability of the coursework delivered, vis-à-vis the original program description (Attachment 2 of the referenced Cooperative Agreement);
- b. assess the effectiveness of the training on the students' performance;
- c. assess institutional improvements as a result of this training;
- d. analyze the evolution of the training materials in the process of their "South-South" transfer. Specifically, examine the original modules in Bolivia, their adaptation to Brazil, and their further adaptation to Africa, evaluating the suitability of these changes;
- e. examine the cost structure of the training programs to determine the likelihood of sustainability beyond the grant programs;
- f. assess the technical capacity of host country training institutions to sustain both post-graduate and NGO training programs; and,
- g. propose the next steps in the grant program.

7. **METHODOLOGY:**

- a. Conduct a joint review of existing information, such as progress reports, the previous mid-term evaluation, written materials related to training methodology, curricula, workbooks, class schedules, class attendance, etc.;
- b. conduct interviews with staff personnel and faculty members;
- c. conduct a post-training survey to measure the effectiveness of the training in the reality of the follow-up work environment. The post training surveys will be the responsibility of Dr. Fred Hartmann. Results of the surveys will be provided to Dr. Villalobos for analysis and interpretation into the final report.
- d. Specific evaluation questions and methodology for answering them will be communicated directly between the evaluators, and will be discussed in the planning phase of the evaluation.

8. **EVALUATION TEAM:**

- A. Brazil: Dr. Fred Hartmann and Dr. Jim Villalobos, amplified and assisted by local Esperança staff and an intern from Tufts University;
- B. Bolivia: Dr. Villalobos, assisted by local Esperança staff;
- C. Africa: Dr. Villalobos, assisted by Esperança staff in Mozambique and Guinea-Bissau.

**9. PROCEDURES/SCHEDULES/LOGISTICS:** The schedule call for the Brazil evaluation first (third week of April, 1997), the Bolivia evaluation immediately thereafter, and finally the Africa phase. The Guinea-Bissau phase will be omitted because of the relatively small effort in that country. Study materials, curricula and training manuals related to the program in Guinea-Bissau will be reviewed in Mozambique. Transportatin in the field will be coordinated with local Esperança teams and will be provided by Esperança.

A. Bolivia. The evaluation will take place in Santa Cruz, with an ample supply of taxis and air service. Some of the coursework was carried out in other large cities of Bolivia, notably Cochabamba and Tarija, and trips to those cities may be undertaken by the main evaluator (Villalobos). The survey and data collection process is being conducted before their arrival by Esperança staff and special data analysts hire for the evaluation.

B. Brazil. Santarem, the locus of all of the training in Brazil, is the headquarters of the Fundação Esperança. Transportation and lodging are available, and like in Bolivia, data collection and evaluation will precede the arrival of Hartmann and Villalobos.

C. Africa. There is adequate local transportation in Maputo, the capital of Mozambique. Esperança staff on the ground will assist in the data collection, analysis and in the logistics of the visit by Dr. Villalobos.

**10. DELIVERABLES:** A final evaluation document submitted both in diskette and hard copy will be submitted to the PVC Project Officer and AMA Program Manager. The report will follow the format and requirements listed below. The expected deadline for the final report is June 30, 1997. This date may be adjusted depending upon the date of completion of the Africa field work. (ADDED NOTE: Although submission of final report was officially extended to August 31, 1997, results of the preliminary evaluation of the Bolivia data, as conducted by the Fundação Esperança, was not received by this Consultant until October, 1997).

**11. REPORTING REQUIREMENTS AND FINAL REPORT FORMAT.** The final report will be delivered in Washington. Final format and software is to be determined at the completion of the field work by the PVC Project Officer or by the AMA Project Manager. The final evaluation document should be concise. The length should be between 25-40 single spaced typewritten pages in length and include tables to illustrate graphics and charts. The report should contain the following sections at a minimum:

- **Title Page** - including the project name and number, names and titles of consultants and evaluation team members, that this is a final evaluation, the date, and who commissioned the report.
- List of Acronyms used in the report.
- Executive Summary.
- Table of Contents.
- Introduction and Background.
- Methodology used.
- Findings and Conclusions.

**Required Appendices:**

1. The Scope of Work for the Evaluation.
2. The Evaluation Itinerary.
3. Lists of Persons Interviewed.

**12. BUDGET:** Costs for Dr. Hartman and the local hires in Bolivia (the most complex of the country sites because of the tri-city reach of the program over eight years), will be covered by the funds available for "evaluation" under the subject Matching Grant. The same is true in Brazil: Hartman costs are covered by the Cooperative Agreement. Of course, the assistance of Esperança staff in those countries is also covered by the Grant. Only Dr. Villalobos' compensation and international travel, plus per diem, would be covered by a separate contracting agreement between USAID and Dr. Villalobos. In Africa, Dr. Villalobos will be assisted with preliminary work and concurrent assistance during his trip by Esperança staff. Again, the Cooperative Agreement will cover their costs, while the separate contract will cover the costs for Dr. Villalobos. All local travel expenses for Dr. Villalobos will be covered by Esperança.

**13. LEVEL OF EFFORT:** See the attached level of effort chart.

**14. CONTACT PERSON:**

USAID: Cathy Bowes, PVC Project Officer, (703) 351-0190.

AMA Technologies: Noreen O'Meara, AMA Project Manager, (703) 741-0564.

PVO: This outline has been developed by Chuck Post, Executive Director of Experança, Inc. (602) 252-7772, Ext. 103. Starting in April through June, 1997, Mr. Post will be assisted by Kurt Henne, MPH (Ext. 109), who will be assigned to the Experança headquarters office in Phoenix, Arizona. In July and later, Mr. Post may become the contact point again, depending on personnel developments at headquarters.

#### LEVEL OF EFFORT

ESPERANÇA FINAL EVALUATION  
April, 1997 - ???  
Estimated Level of Effort

| TASKS                      | LEVEL OF EFFORT |
|----------------------------|-----------------|
| Preparation/Background     | 2               |
| TPM                        | 1               |
| Questionnaire Development  | 2               |
| Travel                     | 7               |
| Overseas Field Work        | 22              |
| Debriefing Project Officer | 1               |
| Report Drafting            | 8               |
| Report Revision            | 2               |
| Report Finalization        | 2               |
| <b>TOTAL</b>               | <b>47</b>       |

\*Based on 6-day work week  
in three countries -  
Brazil (6), Bolivia (6),  
Mozambique (10)

Agreed: \_\_\_\_\_  
Noreen O'Meara, PM

\_\_\_\_\_  
Cathy Bowes, Project Officer

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jim Villalobos, Evaluator